MINJER 1983-84

THE CASE OF FATHER MC GLYNN

A Symposium on the famous Catholic priest Edward McGlynn was sponsored by the Henry George Institute and held November 5. Father McGlynn (also known as Dr. McGlynn as he held a doctor's degree) was pastor of St. Stephen's Church in New York. He was an advocate of the teachings of Henry George and supported George's candidacy for Mayor of New York in 1886. He was warned against this by his superior, Archbishop Michael Corrigan, but did not obey, feeling he was within his rights as an American citizen. He was thereupon suspended, then excommunicated. During his excommunication he founded the Anti-Poverty Society and preached there. Eventually, following an investigation initiated by Rome, he was reinstated as a priest.

The Symposium, held at the New York Henry George School and attended by over 50 persons, sought to explore various aspects of "the McGlynn case" and featured the following speakers:

Duane Whelan, a grandnephew of Father McGlynn, recounted the life of his famous Though Father McGlynn had died many years before Mr. Whelan was born, he heard much about him. Edward McGlynn came from a large family. He received his doctorate (in philosophy and religion) in Rome at age 23 and was ordained as a priest in Rome. When he returned to New York he was eventually appointed as pastor of St. Stephen's. His special interest was working for the benefit of the poor. Realizing that all this work did not solve the problem of poverty, he read Henry George's Progress and Poverty and was convinced that here was the answer. Poverty is not in God's plan and George showed how it could be eradicated. His support of George led to his excommunie cation. There was intense controversy about this inside and outside Catholic circles, until a papal ablegate, Msgr. Satolli, was sent from Rome to look into the case. Father McGlynn was reinstated as a priest in 1892 without retracting his beliefs. He was assigned to St. Mary's Church in Newburgh, N.Y. and died there in 1900. At the funeral of Henry George in 1897, Father McGlynn said, "Just as truly as there was a man sent of God whose name was John, there was a man sent of God whose name was Henry George." Mr. Whelan added: "And there was a man sent of God whose name was Edward McGlynn."

The next speaker was Father James Gilhooley, coincidentally serving in Newburgh where he teaches at Mount St. Mary College. Father Gilhooley wrote an article for the magazine America on McGlynn entitled "Soggarth Aroon" (Irish for "beloved priest"). He also spoke at the Henry George Institute last June, touching on the repercussions of the McGlynn case. Pursuing this theme he spoke at the Symposium on issues raised by the McGlynn case. Father McGlynn had very advanced ideas. He not only espoused George's ideas, he also felt priests should be able to marry, he was against parochial schools and he was firmly for the separation of church and state. He wanted to see American Catholicism develop relatively independent of Rome. Ironically, the furore he aroused led to the opposite result. Rome intervened and thereafter played a leading role in guiding the American Catholic Church.

An example of this effect is seen in the case of Father Francis Duffy, who started out as a leading intellectual with an influence second only to that of McGlynn. The difference was that when Father Duffy was told to be silent he became silent. From intellectual work he moved to pastoral work. He is best known as the chaplain of the "Fighting 69th" in World War I and his statue stands in Duffy Square on Broadway in New York. (Pat O'Brien portrayed him in a movie as a "jock priest", the type that "presides over Bingo.") But itsis tragic that his intellectual career was nipped in the bud. Thus American Catholicism after McGlynn sank into "peaceful hibernation" and this lasted for a half century until Vatican II resurrected the spirit of Father Duffy's early efforts at intellectual outreach.

Next on the program was George L. Collins, Director of the Philadelphia Henry George School. During Father McGlynn's excommunication he packed audiences into meet-

ings of the Anti-Poverty Society (founded by himself and Henry George) where he gave rousing lectures that were really sermons, emphasizing the social side of religion and the religious side of social reform. Mr. Collins gave a reading of one of his speeches, "Religion Vs. Robbery", in which McGlynn gave his idea of true religion. God surely intended that all His children enjoy His bounty, and this means that the earth is for all and not for a privileged few. Poverty is not ordained by God and Henry George showed how it could be overcome.

Dr. C. Joseph Nuesse, Provost Emeritus of the Catholic University of America, spoke on George's possible influence on the Vatican. In 1891 appeared Pope Leo XIII's landmark encyclical, Rerum Novarum, considered a basis of Catholic social teaching. Since it opposed attacks on property in land, Henry George felt that this encyclical was directed, at least in part, against his teachings. He undertook a reply in the form of an Open Letter to the Pope, The Condition of Labor, in which he outlined his philsophy, explained the special nature of land, showed that his ideas were not socialistic and were indeed in accord with the spirit of Church teachings. A specially bound copy was presented to the Pope through a contact in the Vatican.

Dr. Nuesse went to Rome in connection with research on the history of the Catholic University of America and received an assignment from the Robert Schalkenbach Foundation to trace George's Open Letter. He could not find the presentation copy, nor could he find a record of it, which is curious, because Vatican Library records are very complete. He did find two copies of a regular edition of George's Open Letter in the Vatican Library, apparently unread.

Nor could Dr. Nuesse find evidence of the reinstatement of Father McGlynn as a result of George's Open Letter and he said there were efforts at reconciliation before George's opus. However, he noted that the McGlynn episode and George's Open Letter have attracted continuing attention on the part of Catholic scholars and there are works on the subject at the Catholic University.

Robert Clancy, President of the Henry George Institute, observed that influence is often difficult to trace and while there may be no direct evidence of a Georgist influence, it may be that some of his ideas percolated in Vatican circles. The first important social encyclical was Quadragesimo Anno issued by Pope Pius XI in 1931 on the 40th anniversary of Rerum Novarum. Beginning with this encyclical and in succeeding messages of Pius XII, John XXIII, Paul VI and John Paul II, there is a different tone that stresses the social responsibility of property and the rights of all mankind to the gifts of God. And no later Pope specifically justified private property in land as did Leo XIII.

Papal social messages are given usually on decennial anniversaries of Rerum Novarum, the last one by John Paul II in 1981. Mr. Clancy expressed the hope that in 1991, the 100th anniversary, there might be an encyclical that would mote strongly support the Georgist principles.

Rev. W. Wylie Young, Presbyterian Minister and long-time Georgist, closed the Symposium with a non-Catholic view of the McGlynn case. He pointed out that the Georgist philsophy is just as difficult to put over among Protestants as among Catholics, citing his own experience. Few Christians, or even Jews, understand the Bible they revere. What made the Hebrews so special was that they renounced private property in land. It was left to Henry George to discover the Law of Rent, one of the greatest discoveries in history, and to show how the principle of common property in land could be applied in civilized society.

Tapes of the McGlynn Symposium may be obtained from the Henry George Institute for \$25. The story of Father McGlynn may be read in the book Rebel, Priest and Prophet by Stephen Bell, available from the Robert Schalkenbach Foundation for \$3.00.