When 'winner' loses all in the housing market

In a new book, Fred Harrison argues a personal but worrying economic prognosis for homeowners

by Fred Harrison
The Observer
27th March, 2005

House hunters are searching for bargains this weekend. But price discounts offered by anxious sellers will not save today's buyers from walking into the negative equity trap.

The market is set to recover after the election, when Britain will lurch into what I call the 'Winner's Curse' phase of the property cycle. This is when people make the biggest upward errors in their calculation of what a property is worth to secure the house of their dreams.

Tony Blair has already had a taste of what is looming for thousands of property speculators. He and his wife have bought a west London pad for £3.6 million, a multiple of six times their joint earnings, and are having difficulty finding a tenant to pick up the cost of their mortgage.

But the Blairs' travails will not be on the minds of many Easter house hunters, who, beguiled by the huge capital gains achieved since New Labour came to power, will convince themselves that they are safe in Gordon Brown's hands.

I forecast that the multiple of house prices to incomes will reach a record 6.5 as borrowers are enticed by the generous lending policies of banks and building societies. This is not the message promoted by New Labour. Blair is building his re-election strategy around Brown's claim that he has unpicked the patterns of history.

Brown promotes his record as historically unique. I contest this on his own grounds. He identifies volatile house prices as the primary agent for instability: 'Most stop-go problems that Britain has suffered in the last 50 years have been led or influenced by the more highly cyclical, and often more volatile, nature of our housing market.'

Under Brown's chancellorship, house prices have hit record levels since 1997. First-time buyers were squeezed out of the market two years ago, replaced by middle-income earners, who pursued the pension prospects from buy-to-let properties. But many of them are being squeezed by the rise in interest rates to 4.75 per cent.

Bank of England governor Mervyn King claims that nobody knows what will happen to the housing market. I disagree. While Brown appealed to 200 years of evidence to dramatise his record of macro-management, I have searched 400 years of economic history for the common links to booms and busts. History points to a classic bust. Both the commercial and residential property markets will continue to rise until the turn of 2007 into 2008, after which Britain will slide into a savage recession in 2010.

In 1983, I used the trends in residential land values to forecast a recession in 1992. I was correct. The Lawson boom/bust echoed the Barber boom/bust of 1972-74. Nigel Lawson believed that he, too, was tough enough to end the stop/go swings. But he ignored the one leading indicator that would have signalled trouble ahead: the price of land soared above house prices.

Brown failed to take measures against another land boom. He wants us to believe that his decision to make the Bank of England independent was a turning point in economic policy. But the US Federal Reserve has been independent for the best part of a century and presided over one boom/bust after another.

So how did Britain avoid the recession of 2001 which caused grief in the US and Europe? Brown pulled off his Houdini trick by standing Keynes on his head. Instead of the government pump-priming the economy - which would have meant raising taxes or increasing the national debt - he allowed the house market to bubble. Encouraged by low interest rates, people went on a spending spree. They reduced savings and extracted equity from their homes to fuel a consumption boom, offsetting the industrial sector's recession.

The result was household debt that today exceeds £1 trillion. The financial trap that now looms will be camouflaged for a time by the recovery of house prices. Brown's Budget promise to subsidise the mortgages of struggling low-income buyers will give an upward twist to prices, as will John Prescott's town-building plans.

It is too late for Brown to forestall the crash. In fact, the Treasury will make things worse with its plan for a new tax that will help to bump up land prices.

Brown believes that high house prices are due to the drop in the output of new homes. He commissioned Kate Barker, a member of the Bank of England's Monetary Policy Committee, to investigate ways to increase the supply. The Treasury is now strongly tipped to favour a tax on land values, levied when builders apply for planning permission. That revenue from land speculation is supposed to help pay for the roads and schools needed by Prescott's 'sustainable communities' east of London. But a tax on land levied at the point of development is self-defeating. Owners would withdraw from the market and wait for a Tory government to abolish the levy.

Barker insists a development land tax 'is certainly still on the Treasury's radar screen'. I expect that the tax will be introduced to pay for infrastructure, delivering an added upward twist to land values just as prices are pushed into the Winner's Curse zone.

In Boom Bust, I trace land values over four centuries. They move in 18-year cycles, identifying a clear pattern of turning points in the economy. Embedded in this process is a 14-year house-building cycle, terminating in feverish land speculation. During the last two years of the construction cycle people recklessly expose themselves to the Winner's Curse.

In the land market, a rise in demand cannot result in an offsetting increase in supply in places where people want to live and work. So prices are driven to dizzying heights by speculators, who outbid each other with offers for tracts that cannot yield an economic return. The market stalls and the house of cards comes crashing down.

The timetable is dictated by a financial mechanism, at the heart of which is the rate of interest on mortgages. From 1714, this was pegged by the markets at 5 per cent. Today, the MPC is contemplating raising its rate of 4.75 per cent in response to inflationary pressures. The return of the rate to 5 per cent will mark the final phase of the property cycle. Many house buyers who think they are about to pull off great deals this Easter will pay a heavy price in the recession of 2010.

Capital's housing market 'to suffer'

by Matthew Magee
The Herald
3rd April, 2005

Scotland's homeowners will face the first experience of negative equity in a house price crash due in 2008, according to an author who claims to have studied house price data for the past 300 years.

The market will continue to soar before collapsing and prompting a recession which will turn into a global depression by 2010, argued Fred Harrison, author of Boom Bust, a study of the UK housing market.

"For the first time Scotland is going to see a serious case of negative equity. Edinburgh in particular will suffer very badly with the kind of problem England had back in 1992 and in 1975" said Harrison. "By the end of the decade Britain will be in a deep depression."

Harrison's theory flies in the face of data


300-year study of housing market points to recession followed by depression

Capital's housing market 'to suffer'

By Matthew Magee

RBS comment: page seven

released on Thursday that suggests the housing market is cooling slowly. Figures from Nationwide said this is consistent with its predictions of a soft landing for the UK property market.
His theory is based on an analysis of property prices since the establishment of the first building societies in the late eighteenth centuries. "When the first building society was formed in Birmingham in 1775 they charged members interest at 5% and took 14 years to build all their houses," said Harrison. "Since then, with interest rates at around 5%, 14 years has been the length of the construction cycle. The business cycle is driven by that underlying construction cycle. That cycle has lasted for 300 years.
A period of frenzied speculation drives land prices to unsustainable values, prompting a collapse and a stalling of house building activity, which itself is a major economic driver. The resulting economic slowdown exacerbates consumers' inability to buy houses and this vicious circle results in a recession, claims Harrison.
Not everyone is convinced that the housing market is on the brink of collapse, or that a collapse would cause a recession. "We should always be wary of monocausal explanations and predictions," said Andrew McLaughlin, chief economist with the Royal Bank of Scotland. "Although we spend a lot of time talking about recessions and depressions they are actually quite rare events. There have only been three in the UK since 1945.
"Perhaps you could say that the wider economy can cause a house price crash, but you can't say a house price crash causes a depression," said McLaughlin. Even current worries about house prices outstripping wages require detailed analysis. "People worry that average house prices are a bigger multiple of average earnings," said Donald MacRae , chief ecoomist with Lloyds TSB Scotland. "But many households have two incomes and a lot of equity in homes. It is more accurate to look at household incomes and the values of loans taken out, and if you look at that the rise is not that big at all."
In Scotland the house price to income ratio jumped from 3.3 to 4.2 between 2001 and 2004, and 4.5 to 6 in England, whereas the loan to income ratio only jumped from 2.4 to 2.7 in the same period in Scotland, and 2.8 to 3.4 in England.
Harrison's radical solution to the cyclical nature of the housing market is to abolish income tax and corporation tax and replace it with a kind of super-charged council tax, a tax on land values which he says will slow property speculation.

Want to get rid of boom and bust? Tax land, not income

by Fred Harrison
The Guardian
11th April, 2005

Boom and bust is the mother of negative equity, but in last month's budget speech, Gordon Brown made an astonishing claim: he had terminated the stop-go cycle that has afflicted Britain since 1701.

After a peak in activity in 1705, the next 300 years were sliced into a pattern of 18-year business cycles, each punctured by a mid-cycle recession. The dynamics of a 14-year construction cycle accounted for the major turning points. My investigation, Boom

Expert predicts major economic crash looming

Housing slide could trigger recession

By Iain Harrison

THE economist who predicted Britain's 1992 recession has warned that the next significant economic crash is looming.

Fred Harrison claims the UK's house price bubble will burst by 2007, sparking a savage depression in 2010.

He says the slump will wipe a staggering £800 billion off the value of the nation's housing stock, with Scotland being hit particularly hard.

Executive Director of the Land Research Trust, Mr Harrison believes the knock-on effect will result in job losses.

The fiscal expert has spent 25 years studying the economic cycles of the UK economy.

In his 1983 book, *The Power in the Land*, Mr Harrison accurately predicted that Britain would be hit by recession nine years later.

Despite submitting his findings to the Thatcher government's treasury select committee, his concerns went unheeded.

Harrison's analysis has revealed a remarkably consistent pattern. The country enjoys an economic peak every 18 years. But after the boom years comes the bust.

And he claims the drop in house prices has started already and will have fully hit within two years. While recession won't begin immediately, it will be here by 2010.

Ransom

"For 300 years, we've paid on average five per cent for a mortgage," he explains. "That delivers a building cycle that lasts about 14 years. Towards the end of each cycle speculators try to corner the market in land.

"They then hold communities to ransom and make a killing by selling the land when people are desperate for it.

"As a result a few people get very rich but the effect pushes house prices so high they became unaffordable.

"So the housing industry shuts down,

building firms go bust, people are sacked and the public stop spending money."

Mr Harrison says the increasing trend towards re-mortgaging is one of the core problems.

"People withdraw all the equity in their houses which leads to a 'let's live beyond our means' psychology," he says.

"This helps drive up prices and as a result people think they'll make large profits out of buying and selling so they trade up.

"I would urge people to think very carefully about investing in the property market from now on, because they may end up losing the shirt off their backs."

Ed Stansfield, of Capital Economics, backs Mr Harrison's theories on the housing market but falls short of predicting an all-out recession. "We believe house prices peaked at the end of 2004 and by the end of 2007 we will see average prices fall by 20 per cent," he adds.

■ *Boom Bust*, published by Shepheard Walwyn, ISBN 0 85683 189 1, is launched tomorrow in Edinburgh at Blackwell's Bookshop, 6.30-7.30pm.